

Lauren Hansen (CA BAR NO. 268417)
Melissa A. Morris (CA BAR NO. 233393)
PUBLIC INTEREST LAW PROJECT
449 15th St., Suite 301
Oakland, CA 94612-06001
Tel: (510) 891-9794
Fax: (510) 891-9727
Email: lhansen@pilpca.org

Lili V. Graham (CA BAR NO. 284264)
DISABILITY RIGHTS CALIFORNIA
350 S Bixel Street, Ste 290
Los Angeles, CA 90017-1418
Tel: (213) 213-8000
Fax: (213) 213-8001
Email: lili.graham@disabilityrightsca.org

(Additional counsel on following page)

Attorneys for INTERVENORS
HOSPITALITY HOUSE; AND
COALITION ON HOMELESSNESS

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

COLLEGE OF THE LAW, SAN FRANCISCO, a public trust and institution of higher education duly organized under the laws and the Constitution of the State of California; FALLON VICTORIA, an individual; RENE DENIS, an individual; TENDERLOIN MERCHANTS AND PROPERTY ASSOCIATION, a business association; RANDY HUGHES, an individual; and KRISTEN VILLALOBOS, an individual.

Plaintiffs,

V.

CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO, a
municipal entity,

Defendant.

Case No. 4:20-cv-3033-JST

[PROPOSED] ORDER
DENYING DEFENDANT
CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN
FRANCISCO'S
ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION
TO CONSIDER WHETHER
CASES SHOULD BE
RELATED

Action Filed: May 4, 2020

Action Closed: Oct. 7, 2020

1 Michael David Keys (CA BAR NO. 133815)
2 BAY AREA LEGAL AID
3 1454 43rd Avenue
4 San Francisco, CA 94122
5 Tel: (415) 982-1300
6 Fax: (415) 982-4243
7 Email: mkeys@baylegal.org

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
(Counsel for Intervenors continued from previous page)

1 **[PROPOSED] ORDER DENYING DEFENDANT CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN**
 2 **FRANCISCO'S ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO CONSIDER WHETHER CASES**
 3 **SHOULD BE RELATED**

4 Now before the Court is Defendant City and County of San Francisco's Administrative
 5 Motion to Consider Whether Cases Are Related, Pursuant to Civil Local Rules 3-12 and 7-11.
 6 Dkt. No. 116. The motion seeks to relate *Coalition on Homelessness et al. v. City and County of*
 7 *San Francisco et al*, Case No. 4:22-cv-05502-DMR (*COH v. SF*) to this matter.

8 Having read and considered Defendant's motion and the responses of Plaintiffs,
 9 Intervenors, and plaintiffs in *COH v. SF*, along with their concurrently-filed declarations, and
 10 good cause having been shown, the Court hereby DENIES Defendant's Administrative Motion
 11 to Relate the two cases.

12 Neither of the factors listed under Local Rule 3-12(a) exist here. The two cases involve
 13 different parties, claims, and events. Moreover, granting Defendant's Motion would reduce
 14 judicial efficiency. *COH v. SF* has been underway for over a year before Judge Ryu, who has
 15 invested significant time into considering and ruling on multiple substantive motions and has
 16 entered and overseen a preliminary injunction. Duplication is unlikely because the instant matter
 17 has been closed for over three years with no substantive matters pending. *See Rezner v.*
 18 *Bayerische Hypo-UND Vereinsbank AG*, Nos. C 06-02064 JW, C 08-03479 SC, 2009 WL
 19 3458704 *1 (N.D. Cal. Oct. 23, 2009).

20 Accordingly, Defendant's request to relate the two cases is denied with prejudice.
 21 It is so ordered.

23 Dated: _____, 2023

24 _____
 25 Honorable Jon S. Tigar
 26 United States District Judge